



## PREFACE

The *Symposium Philosophiae Antiquae Secundum Therense* “Aristotle on Plato: The Metaphysical Question” took place in Santorini between the 30<sup>th</sup> of June and the 7<sup>th</sup> of July, 2002. It belongs to a newly instituted series of specialized, annual, international conferences in the field of ancient Greek philosophy. The guiding idea for these colloques is to provide an appropriate forum, informal but focused, where a select group of invited scholars, with significant work in the area, may concentrate on the particular subject of their common competence that has been set for the meeting, thoroughly articulate an argument of their views on it and enter into substantial debate concerning their several positions.

As an indication of the operative principle, the general programme of this Second Symposium is recorded below. The aim is to create a framework in which the edge of understanding in the given topic may be advanced.

The theme of the Second Symposium was Aristotle’s account and criticism of Platonic metaphysical theory regarding the fundamental structure of reality, in effect his examination of Plato’s theory of concrete things, mathematical, ideas and first principles. A reassessment of this crucial and notorious nexus of problems seemed well-advised. The result of the investigation justifies, I believe, the specific decision. This volume contains the final versions of the papers given at the meeting. A second one to follow later on will include the discussions on the papers and an introduction by the editor locating the contributions within the context of the historical and current controversies on the subject.

The realization of the colloque was made possible by the support, moral and material, of a number of Institutions and a few individual

persons, in public or private capacity, convinced of the importance and utility of ancient Greek philosophy now as ever, and committed to the support of its study, not least in such meetings, which bring for some days together, in a fertile ground of intense intellectual exchange, distinguished workers in the field from various countries.

His Eminence, the Most Reverend former Metropolitan of Thera, Amorgos and Islands, Panteleimon, advocated right from the beginning, steadily promoted and in every way seconded the organization of the Symposium. As president of the Honourary Organizing Committee, he was the source of constant encouragement throughout. I am grateful to the Ministry of Culture, and the then Minister Mr. Evangelos Venizelos in particular, for their sponsorship of the meeting. The Greek Chamber of Engineering contributed to the publication of these Proceedings: my thanks go to its Steering Committee and especially to Mr. Antonios Kotzabasakis, Vice Chairman and Treasurer, for their help. Thanks for their assistance are also due to the other members of the Honourary Organizing Committee, Mrs. Martha Simantoni, then Secretary General of the South Aegean Regional Administration and Mr. Panagiotis Rigas, former Prefect of Cyclades and now a Member of Parliament. Both the Administration and the Prefecture underwrote part of the expenses. Mr. Nicholas Zorzos, as Chairman of the Thera Municipal Council and as good personal friend, was instrumental in many ways in bringing a promising idea to a successful fruition. Furthermore, I gratefully acknowledge the sponsorship of the National Bank of Greece and the manifold help received from Mr. Nikos Damigos, the entrepreneur from Santorini noted for his involvement in the tourist industry of the beautiful island. Credits must go, with pleasure, to Mr. Costas Antzoulatos, President of the Antzoulatos Group of Companies, for grants making this volume possible.

A place of its own is by right reserved in this register of honour to my long-time, trusted and esteemed friend Mr. Petros Doukas, Deputy Minister of Finance. His triple professional career as a distinguished theoretical economist, as a successful businessman and financier and as a statesman both inspired and efficient, is intrinsically punctuated by his thorough interest and involvement in the study of classics. This endeavour, as well as other similar projects of distinction,

essentially benefited from his unflinching all-round support and his influential devotion to excellence.

We had the fortune to stay during the Symposium at *Cori Rigas Apartments*, a remarkable boutique-hotel in Old Phira, hanging over the cliffs on the inner rim of the Caldera. This hotel, a 18<sup>th</sup> century captain house renovated with faithful respect to its traditional form and setting by its owner, the sculptor Mr. Evangelos Rigas, is described and photographed in Thomas Drexel, *Mediterrane Häuser und ihre Gärten*, Callway Verlag, München, pp. 44-9: Ein altes Kapitänshaus auf Santorin. It is a pleasure to extend our common appreciation and my own indebtedness to Evangelos for his work of art and for the nice attendance we enjoyed there.

As Conference Organizer a Theran Agency was appointed to act, *Kivotos Management Incentive Travel*. For its professional services, and for the personal touches of its Manager Mr. Nikos Zafeiriou, I am especially thankful.

My friend Prof. Spyridon Rangos has helped me generously with his time and knowledge in the organization of the meeting. I thank him cordially. The Indices are the skilful work of Ms. Eirene Kalogridou, at the National Institution for Research.

My debt to Mrs. Aleka Bertsoukli for her superlative secretarial assistance in the conduct of the Institute's business and of my own work is great, permanent and mounting. Mr. Papantonopoulos' typesetting expertise has been proved, and approved, already repeatedly in our publications. Here it is, I believe, fully confirmed once again.

Apostolos L. Pierris

# PROGRAMME

## SUNDAY JUNE 30th

20.30 Official Opening and Dinner

## MONDAY JULY 1st

- 9.30 – 11.30 **Harrold Tarrant**  
Aristotle's Reports on Plato:  
Three Background Issues
- 11.30 – 12.00 Coffee Break
- 12.00 – 14.00 **Margherita Isnardi-Parente**  
The Different Tradition of Aristotle's De Ideis  
in Relation to that of the Peri Tagathou
- 14.00 Light Lunch
- 18.30 – 20.30 **David Fowler**  
The possible Mathematics of Plato  
and his Predecessors
- 21.30 Dinner

## TUESDAY JULY 2nd

- 9.30 – 11.30 **Klaus Brinkmann**  
Beyond Platonic Forms: Aristotelian Essentialism
- 11.30 – 12.00 Coffee Break
- 12.00 – 14.00 **Andrew Smith**  
Plotinus on Ideas between Plato and Aristotle
- 14.00 Light Lunch
- 17.00 – 20.30 Guided Visit to the Archaeological Site  
of Ancient Thera (Mesa Vouno)
- 21.30 Dinner

**WEDNESDAY, JULY 3rd**

- 9.30 – 11.30 **Ian Mueller**  
Forms and Numbers
- 11.30 – 12.00 Coffee Break
- 12.00 – 14.00 **Elisabetta Cattanei**  
The Problem of the Generation of the Numbers
- 14.15 – 15.30 Guided visit to the Archaeological Museum  
in Phira
- 15.30 Light Lunch
- 21.30 Dinner

**THURSDAY, JULY 4th**

- 9.30 – 11.30 **Mary Louise Gill**  
Plato's First Principles
- 11.30 – 12.00 Coffee Break
- 12.00 – 14.00 **Andreas Graeser**  
Speusippus as Critic of the Platonic Theory  
of Principles
- 14.00 Light Lunch
- 18.30 – 20.30 **David Ambuel**  
Good and One: Determination in Aristotle's Plato
- 21.30 Dinner

## FRIDAY, JULY 5th

- 9.30 – 11.30 **Kenneth Sayre**  
Several References in Plato to the Indefinite Dyad
- 11.30 – 12.00 Coffee Break
- 12.00 – 14.00 **Apostolos Pierris**  
The Other Platonic Principle
- 14.00 Light Lunch
- 18.30 – 20.30 Concluding Discussion
- 21.30 Dinner

## SATURDAY, JULY 6th

- 9.00 Guided Visit to the Museum of Minoan  
Antiquities in Phira, to the Akrotiri Excavation Site  
(Minoan City) and to Oia
- 21.30 Farewell Dinner

## SUNDAY, JULY 7th

Departure

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

HAROLD TARRANT ARISTOTLE'S REPORTS ON PLATO: THREE BACKGROUND ISSUES .....	15
MARGHERITA ISNARDI-PARENTE LA DIFFÉRENTE TRADITION DU <i>περί τὰγαθοῦ</i> (DE BONO) PAR RAPPORT AU DE IDEIS .....	33
DAVID FOWLER THE POSSIBLE MATHEMATICS OF PLATO AND HIS PREDECESSORS .....	43
KLAUS BRINKMANN BEYOND PLATONIC FORMS: ARISTOTELIAN ESSENTIALISM .....	57
ANDREW SMITH PLOTINUS ON IDEAS BETWEEN PLATO AND ARISTOTLE .....	93
IAN MUELLER FORMS AND NUMBERS .....	109
ELISABETTA CATTANEI THE GENERATION OF THE FORM - NUMBERS AND ITS «MANY PAINS» IN ARISTOTLE .....	133
MARY LOUISE GILL PLATO'S FIRST PRINCIPLES .....	155
ANDREAS GRAESER PLATO AND SPEUSIPPUS: AN EXCHANGE ON THE STATUS OF PRINCIPLES ...	177
DAVID AMBUEL GOOD AND ONE: DETERMINATION IN ARISTOTLE'S PLATO .....	185
KENNETH SAYRE SEVERAL REFERENCES IN PLATO TO THE INDEFINITE DYAD .....	217
APOSTOLOS PIERRIS THE OTHER PLATONIC PRINCIPLE .....	239
PARTICIPANTS .....	293
INDEX LOCORUM .....	295
INDEX AUTORUM .....	305